PLANNING COMMITTEE AGENDA

19th April 2018

PART 5: Development Presentations Item 5.2

1. DETAILS OF THE DEVELOPMENT

Ref: 18/01613/PRE

Location: Holmesdale Road Stand, Selhurst Park Stadium, SE26 6PU.

Ward: Selhurst

Description: Erection of part two part four storey high building to the rear of the

Holmesdale Road Stand in connection with the provision of nine self-contained (C3) residential units, and ancillary stadium

facilities at ground floor level.

Drawing Nos: 2nd February 2018 - 17812-KSS-XX-XX- PP-A-0005 DESIGN

AND ACCESS Statement_S1_P101.

Applicant: Crystal Palace Football Club Ltd Agent: Martin Robeson Planning Practice

Case Officer: Barry Valentine

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 This proposed development is being reported to Planning Committee to enable Members to view it at an early stage and to comment upon it. The development does not constitute an application for planning permission and any comments made upon it are provisional and subject to full consideration of any subsequent application including any comments received as a result of consultation, publicity and notification.
- 2.2 It should be noted that this report represents a snapshot in time, with negotiations and dialogue on-going. The plans and information provided to date are indicative only and as such, the depth of analysis provided corresponds with the scope of information that has been made available to Council officers. Other issues may arise as more detail is provided and the depth of analysis expanded upon.
- 2.3 The reason why these proposals are being presented to Planning Committee at a relatively early stage in the pre application process is to give some comfort to Members that the applicant is proactively investigating the prospect of residential development within the grounds of Selhurst Park to offset the loss of housing which would flow from its proposals to increase spectator capacity, pursuant to the planning application (LBC Ref 18/00547/FUL). A report focussing on the planning application to extend/redevelop the "Main Stand" appears elsewhere on this agenda.
- 2.4 The report covers the following points:
 - a. Site briefing
 - b. Summary of matters for consideration
 - c. Officers' preliminary conclusions
 - d. Specific feedback requests

3. SITE BRIEFING

- 3.1 The application site is Selhurst Park Stadium, the home ground of Crystal Palace Football Club (CPFC) since 1924. The site is bounded to the north-west by Whitehorse Lane, to the north-east by Park Road and to the south-east by Holmesdale Road.
- 3.2 The pre application submission relates specifically to the "Holmesdale Road Stand" located on the south-eastern side of the site. The "Holmesdale Road Stand" is currently the tallest of the four stands that enclose the pitch. It is a double tiered stand that opened in 1995 and has a capacity of 8,147 seats.
- 3.3 The site is within Selhurst Ward and is approximately 600m from Selhurst Railway Station, 615m from Norwood Station and 900m from Thornton Heath Railway Station. Public Transport Access Level (PTAL) varies across the site and ranges between 2 and 5 (on a scale of 1 to 6, where 6 is the most accessible). Overall, given the proximity to rail stations, the site is considered to be reasonably well served by public transport.
- 3.4 The area is predominantly residential in character, although within the site itself and in addition to the stadium, is a Sainsbury's supermarket, small shops and a night club (above the supermarket). Adjoining the Sainsbury's supermarket to the north-west are residential flats fronting onto Whitehorse Lane.
- 3.5 The topography within and around the site varies considerably, with land sloping down from the north-east corner of the site (i.e. the junction of Park Road and Holmesdale Road). Land levels drop along Holmesdale Road and Park Road, and levels also drop within the site, with the lowest level being around the fan zone to the south of the "Main Stand".

Proposal

3.6 The proposal is currently

Erection of a two to four storey high building to the rear of the "Holmesdale Road Stand" in connection with the provision of nine residential units and the reprovision of associated stadium ancillary facilities at ground floor level (ticket office, turn stiles and access points). Access to the properties is via an external deck – fronting onto Holmesdale Road utilising the change in levels found on site. The units would be single aspect with amenity spaces at roof level and the proposed mix is currently as follows

7x4 bed

1x3 bed

1x1 bed

4. SUMMARY OF MATTERS FOR CONSIDERATION

4.1 The main matters for consideration in a future submission are as follows:

Principle of Development

- 4.2 The planning application (LBC Ref 18/00547/FUL) proposes the redevelopment of the "Main Stand" which requires the demolition of 6x3 storey residential properties (Use Class C3) located in Wooderson Close. Five of these properties are owned by the Council and managed as affordable housing. The remaining property is in private ownership and is not, for the purposes of planning policy, considered to be an 'affordable housing unit.'
- 4.3 London Plan Policy 3.14 states that the "loss of housing, including affordable housing, should be resisted unless the housing is replaced at existing or higher densities with at least equivalent floorspace". Emerging London Plan Policy H10 makes a similar commitment. Croydon Local Plan (2018) policy SP2.2 criterion (g) states that the Council will not permit development which would result in a net loss of homes or residential land.
- 4.4 On the loss of affordable housing, emerging London Plan policy H10 states that developments should not be permitted unless it is replaced by equivalent or better quality accommodation, providing at least an equivalent level of affordable housing floorspace. The policy states that replacement housing should generally produce an uplift in affordable housing provision. To test if the replacement housing scheme could deliver an uplift in affordable housing, a financial viability appraisal would be required.
- 4.5 As required by the policies above, it is clear that in order for planning permission to be issued for the proposed redevelopment of the "Main Stand", the residential land and homes would need to be re-provided (as a minimum) but preferably at a higher density, with the affordable housing units also to be provided at an minimum equivalent level, which in turn should be tested/justified through a financial viability appraisal.
- 4.6 It is understood that pre application submission seeks to partially address this issue, by re-providing the residential land and associated homes. A separate provision to address the loss of affordable housing as outlined in paragraphs 8.6-8.14 of the officer's report into the "Main Stand" redevelopment (LBC Ref 18/00547/FUL) appears elsewhere on this agenda.
- 4.7 The "Main Stand" proposals would lead to the loss of approximately 900sqm of residential land area. In the purest terms, the proposed development would provide a mixture of residential and commercial spaces rather than purely residential land. However, the pre application proposal (if brought forward and fully realised) would lead to a net increase in the number of residential units (from six to nine units). Similarly, the pre application proposals would lead to an increase in the total residential floorspace provided (from approximately 588sqm to 1,063sqm). The net gain in floorspace would be a 'true net gain' in that it would bring forward replacement floorspace that is not already part of the development pipeline and counted towards in the Borough's five year housing supply.
- 4.8 There would be no loss of occupancy unit types, with all six four bed six person family units being re-provided as part of the pre application proposal.

- 4.9 The six properties that are proposed to be demolished are made up of the two end terrace properties (22 and 24 Wooderson Close and a separate terrace of four properties 26 to 32 Wooderson Close). These properties are all three storeys in height with near identical form and design. They were originally built as four bed six person properties, with a kitchen/dining area at ground floor level, double bedroom and lounge at first floor level and a double bedroom and two single bedrooms at second floor level. They provide between 97sqm to 98sqm of accommodation (according to the original plans). It is worth noting that these units (under current housing floor space standards set out in the London Plan) would be undersized by between 10sqm and 11sqm. The properties have front and rear gardens which do vary in size depending on their location, but their front gardens generally measure in the region of 30sqm and the rear gardens around 50sqm.
- 4.10 The proposed units would all meet minimum floorspace standards set out in the London Plan (2016), with eight of the nine units exceeding the floorspace standards by between 8sqm to 17sqm. The proposed units are likely to received excellent level of sunlight and daylight by virtue of them being broadly south facing. All units would have access to generous sized private amenity spaces in the form of a south facing roof gardens which would measure between 43sqm and 55sqm. Whilst there are some challenges that will need to be overcome, most notably in terms of sound/vibration insulation and ventilation, there is no in principle reason that this could not be overcome through further design evolution and submission of further information. Further details are also required in regards to accessibility and whether the development complies with M4(2) Building Regulations.
- 4.12 Officers are of the view that the proposed units that are being offered as part of the development are likely to be of a better quality that those they would be replacing as they are more generous in size, would experience better quality sunlight and daylight and would have external amenity space of a similar size to the existing rear gardens of the existing properties.

Character, Scale and Massing

- 4.13 The existing Holmesdale Road elevation, particularly at ground and first floor level, has a somewhat utilitarian appearance, defined by two storey high ad hoc buildings that sit behind tall brick walls, which are punctured with turnstiles, entrance gates and ticket counters. These existing structures have very limited architectural merit and their demolition is therefore not seen as contentious. The proposed development provides a welcomed opportunity to improve the stadium frontage onto Holmesdale Road.
- 4.14 The proposed massing (at this very early stage) appears to be well considered in terms of height and scale. Additionally, the proposed curved form should help to integrate the development into the curved design of the proposed "Main Stand" (LBC Ref 18/00547/FUL). Further work is clearly needed to be undertaken, particularly the treatment of the south-east corner of the development. For example, it is not overtly clear from the information submitted why the proposed

- development responds to this condition in the manner articulated by the submitted images.
- 4.15 The rhythm and division of the elevation appears sensitive and helps to relate the proposal to the residential context. This will need to be carried through to the articulation of the cladding detailing as the scheme develops. Concern is also raised regarding the location of the bin store, which could be better integrated into the development.
- 4.16 The proposed material palette, referencing the proposed "Main Stand", including the use of brick masonry and metal cladding, is considered an appropriate approach that should further assist in unifying this proposed intervention and the proposals for the "Main Stand". Further details of the metal and brick specification would need to be further considered and assessed as the scheme develops.
- 4.17 At this early stage, there is an absence of information and plans of the ground floor level and how this will integrate into the public realm. Getting this right will be a critical element in the success of the scheme, which will affect how the scheme experienced and perceived. It is clearly paramount to create a pleasant pedestrian environment and appropriate street scene that is compatible with the existing Holmesdale Road context, but yet has a clear relationship with the remaining elements of the stadium.

Residential Amenity

- 4.18 It is not envisaged that the proposed development would have a significant impact on quality of neighbouring properties' living conditions in terms of light, outlook or privacy.
- 4.19 The most likely residential properties that would be impacted by the development would be the properties situated on the opposite side of Holmesdale Road. The modest three/four storey height of the development would not have a significant impact on daylight received by these neighbouring properties, especially in view of the height of the "Holmesdale Road Stand". The proposed development would not have an unacceptable impact on outlook as a minimum separation distance of 16m from properties on the opposite side of the road would be maintained.
- 4.20 From the information submitted to date, the proposed development would not appear to have an adverse impact on neighbouring properties' privacy, in view of the 16m separation distance (which is a standard window to window separation across streets). Some of the terraces at the south-eastern end of the site may need to have some privacy mitigation measures due to the lower height of development towards the top end of Holmesdale Road.
- 4.21 The creation of additional residential units would not generate significant level of noise disturbance. The external amenity spaces would not cause significant noise disturbance to neighbouring properties as they would be located at least a storey above neighbouring windows. From the limited details that have so far been submitted, officers are unclear as the ground floor details and the associated relationships, but on the assumption that only existing operations

- would be internalised, the re-working of the ground floor level of the stadium would not likely to cause significant noise disturbance to neighbouring properties.
- 4.22 In terms of light pollution, it is expected that the applicant should be able to demonstrate that internal lighting can be designed to limit disturbance to neighbouring properties. However, clearly this will need to be tested as part of the application process.

Highways and Parking

- 4.23 Whilst the PTAL rating does vary across the site, Holmesdale Road frontage has a PTAL rating of 5 (very good). The development therefore has good access to public transport.
- 4.24 No on site car parking is currently proposed. The development is likely to generate some additional car parking pressure to surrounding streets; the impact of which will need to be justified through transport assessment that includes parking stress surveys. The proposals for the "Main Stand" deals extensively with parking issues (during match-days and non-match days) and any new residential occupiers would be party to on-going dialogue around car parking controls in and around the Stadium.
- 4.25 For the residential element for the proposed development to be policy compliant, seventeen cycle parking spaces will need to be provided. The net uplift of internal commercial floor area is not yet known and therefore, the appropriate level of cycle parking for the commercial element has yet to be confirmed. Currently no cycle parking details have been submitted.

Other Considerations

- 4.26 London Plan policy deals with safety and security and seeks to ensure London is resilient to terrorism (development should include measures to design out crime that, in proportion to the risk, deter terrorism, assist in the detection of terrorist activity and help defer its effects). Safety and security must be intrinsic considerations in the detailed design and layout of expanded stadium and spaces around it. The proposed development should incorporate Secured by Design principles.
- 4.27 London Plan Policy 6.3 requires Construction Logistics Plans to be secured. London Plan Policy 7.15 concerns the reduction of noise and enhancement of soundscapes. London Plan Policy 7.21 seeks to improve air quality. Croydon Local Plan: Strategic Policy SP6.3 requires development to positively contribute to improving air and water quality by minimising pollution. Policy SP8.4 states that major development proposals will be required to be supported by transport assessments, travel plan and construction logistic plans. Croydon Local Plan (2018) Policy SP6.4 states that the Council will seek to reduce flood risk and protect groundwater and aquifers. Policy DM25 provides the Council's detailed requirements in relation to drainage and reducing flood risk.

- 4.28 Given the sites location in the heart of a residential area, it is critical that construction is managed in a way that minimises impacts. A Noise Assessment, Air Quality Assessment, a Construction Environmental Management Plan and a Construction Logistics Plan will need to be provided as part of the application submission.
- 4.29 It is understood that the existing entrances on the Holmesdale Road stand provide wheelchair access. Further details on accessibility will be required to be submitted upon application.

5. PRELIMINARY CONCLUSIONS ON KEY ISSUES

- 5.1 The proposed scheme could well represent a solution to potentially overcome concerns raised associated with the loss of housing (associated with the planning application to redevelop the "Main Stand" LBC Ref 18/00547/FUL) and gives some comfort that the applicant is considering resolution of this critical policy requirements. Whilst the loss of 'pure' residential land is unfortunate, the 'true net gain' of residential floorspace and unit numbers/type, alongside improved quality of accommodation (compared to existing provision) would satisfactorily outweigh this loss.
- 5.2 The proposed development is broadly of an appropriate mass and design and represents a good starting point to further progress replacement housing. The scheme would likely result in a high quality building that would improve the appearance of the stadium and make a positive contribution to the street scene and public realm.
- 5.3 The proposed development, given the mass of the existing "Holmsdale Road Stand" would not have an unacceptable impact on neighbouring properties' living condition in terms of light, outlook or privacy. There is sufficient separation distance that neighbouring properties' outlook and privacy would not be unduly harmed.

6 SPECIFIC FEEDBACK REQUES

6.1 Member expectations in dealing with

- View of Members on the principle of the development as a way of offsetting loss of residential land and homes proposed under the "Main Stand" planning application.
- Views of Members of the initial design approach of the scheme (siting, scale, mass, use of materials).
- Impacts of the proposal on neighbouring occupiers and in the wider vicinity of the site.
- Any other matter that Members see as important to secure if this development was to come forward.